Marc S. Dreier (MD-9713) Joel A. Chernov (JC-8789) Regina M. Alter (RA-7014) DREIER LLP 499 Park Avenue New York, New York 10022 (212) 328-6100

Attorneys for Plaintiff

USDC SDNY
DOCUMENT
ELECTRONICALLY FILED
DOC #:
DATE FILED: //30/09

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

MARCELLA DOLCETTI, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

07 CV 2607 (TPG)

-against-

THE REPUBLIC OF ARGENTINA,

AND OPINION

Defendant.

-----X

Plaintiffs are the beneficial owners of certain bond indebtedness issued by defendant, the Republic of Argentina. The Republic defaulted on such indebtedness in December 2001 during a profound fiscal crisis. Plaintiffs are suing to recover amounts due to them as a result of the default and have moved for summary judgment.

The motion is granted.

FACTS

The bond indebtedness at issue is governed by one of two agreements: (1) a Fiscal Agency Agreement dated October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA"), or (2) a Fiscal Agency Agreement dated December 10, 1993 (the "1993 FAA"). The 1994 FAA is the same agreement that governed the bond indebtedness on which this court granted summary judgment to the plaintiffs in <u>Lightwater Corporation Ltd. v. Republic of Argentina</u>, No. 02 Civ. 3804, 2003 WL 1878420 (S.D.N.Y. Apr. 14, 2003). Section 22 of the 1994 FAA and Section 20 of the 1993

FAA state that the Republic waives sovereign immunity and consents to jurisdiction in any state or federal court in the borough of Manhattan in the City of New York. All two agreements provide that the Republic's obligations on the bonds are unconditional and that failure to make any payment of principal or interest for 30 days after the applicable payment date constitutes an event of default. A declaration by the Republic of a moratorium on the payment of principal or interest on its public external indebtedness is an event of default as well. Paragraph 12 of the 1994 FAA provides for acceleration of principal if there is a failure to pay interest or a moratorium. If either of these events occurs,

each holder of Securities and such Series may by such notice in writing declare the principal amount of Securities of such Series held by it to be due and payable immediately....

On December 24, 2001 the Republic declared a moratorium on payments of principal and interest on the external debt of the Republic. The court refers to its previous opinions for a description of the circumstances of these defaults. <u>Lightwater</u>, 2003 WL 1878420, at *2; <u>Applestein v. Republic of Argentina</u>, No. 02 Civ. 1773, 2003 WL 1990206, at *1 (S.D.N.Y. Apr. 29, 2003). In or about March 27, 2007, plaintiffs sent notices to Bankers Trust Company, the Fiscal Agent of the Republic of Argentina, declaring the principal amounts of the debt securities governed by the 1994 FAA and the 1993 FAA to be immediately due and payable.

The bonds that are the subject of this action are listed hereafter. Also listed are the amounts of the beneficial interests owned by each plaintiff.¹

The court notes the distinction between bonds and beneficial interests. In some previous opinions, the court has simply referred to the plaintiffs as owners of "bonds," when in fact plaintiffs are technically owners of "beneficial interests in bonds." The Republic actually issues "a bond" to a depository. The depository, in some form, issues "participations" to brokers, who sell "beneficial interests" to purchasers. These beneficial interests are identified by reference to the underlying bond (CUSIP or ISIN number or both; date of issuance and maturity; rate of interest) and the principal amount of the beneficial interest. This distinction is discussed more fully in Million Air Corp. v. Republic of Argentina, No. 04 Civ. 1048, 2005 WL 256126 (S.D.N.Y. Oct. 17, 2005).

The following tables contain the necessary identifying information regarding each plaintiff's beneficial interests in bonds.

Table 1.

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	MARCELLA DOLCETTI
Face Value:	U.S. \$5,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114GD65
Date Of Issuance:	February 21, 2001
Date Of Maturity:	February 21, 2012
Interest Rate/Payable:	12.375 %
Date Of Purchase:	December 1, 2004
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from Cassa di Risparmio di Ferrara, dated as of June 30, 2007.

3

į

<u>Table 2.</u>

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	CARLO CIGOLINI
Face Value:	U.S. \$13,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114GF14
Date Of Issuance:	June 19, 2001
Date Of Maturity:	December 19, 2008
Interest Rate/Payable:	7 % / 15.5%
Date Of Purchase:	Between March 10, 2003 and November 11, 2003
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FΛA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from Unicredit Banca, dated as of October 2, 2007.

Table 3.

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	CARLO CIGOLINI
Face Value:	U.S. \$33,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114AN02
Date Of Issuance:	October 9, 1996
Date Of Maturity:	October 9, 2006
Interest Rate/Payable:	11 %
Date Of Purchase:	Between March 10 and November 11, 2003
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from Unicredit Banca, dated as of October 2, 2007.

Table 4.

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	CARLO CIGOLINI
Beneficial Owner.	
Face Value:	U.S. \$13,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB	ISIN No. US040114BE93
<u>No.</u> :	
Date Of Issuance:	April 7, 1999
Date Of Maturity:	April 7, 2009
Interest Rate/Payable:	11.750 %
Date Of Purchase:	Between March 10 and November 11, 2003
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from Unicredit Banca, dated as of October 2, 2007.

Table 5.

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	JUAN EDUARDO COLOMBO and ESTELA ISABEL DELGADO
Face Value:	U.S. \$100,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114AV28
<u>Date Of Issuance</u> :	September 19, 1997
Date Of Maturity:	September 19, 2027
Interest Rate/Payable:	9.75 %
Date Of Purchase:	Between January 8, 1999 and August 18, 1999
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Certification letter from Caja de Valores, dated as of September 20, 2007.

7

<u>Table 6.</u>

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	CARLA NANNI
Face Value:	U.S. \$125,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114AR16
Date Of Issuance:	January 30, 1997
Date Of Maturity:	January 30, 2017
Interest Rate/Payable:	11.375 %
Date Of Purchase:	November 7, 2006
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from UniCredit Xelion Banca, dated as of September 7, 2007.

8

Table 7.

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	CARLA NANNI
Face Value:	U.S. \$100,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114BE93
Date Of Issuance:	April 7, 1999
Date Of Maturity:	April 7, 2009
Interest Rate/Payable:	11.75 %
Date Of Purchase:	November 7, 2006
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from UniCredit Xelion Banca, dated September 7, 2007.

Table 8.

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	MAURIZIO PETRONI
Face Value:	U.S. \$700,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114BE93
Date Of Issuance:	April 7, 1999
Date Of Maturity:	April 7, 2009
Interest Rate/Payable:	11.75 %
Date Of Purchase:	Between November 10, 2006 and November 28, 2006
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from UniCredit Xelion Banca, dated September 7, 2007.

Table 9.

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	ROBERTO AKMAN and LILIANA EDITH GENNI
Face Value:	U.S. \$100,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114AH34
Date Of Issuance:	December 20, 1993
Date Of Maturity:	December 20, 2003
Interest Rate/Payable:	8.375 %
Date Of Purchase:	March 20, 2000
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of December 10, 1993 (the "1993 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from Bank Leumi, dated as of August 31, 2007.

11

Table 10.

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	ROBERTO AKMAN and LILIANA EDITH GENNI
Face Value:	U.S. \$335,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114BE93
Date Of Issuance:	April 7, 1999
Date Of Maturity:	April 7, 2009
Interest Rate/Payable:	11.75 %
Date Of Purchase:	August 15, 2000
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from Bank Leumi, dated as of August 31, 2007.

<u>Table 11.</u>

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	NAVA TELLADE and GABRIELE DOLCETTI
Face Value:	U.S. \$94,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114GD65
Date Of Issuance:	February 21, 2001
Date Of Maturity:	February 21, 2012
Interest Rate/Payable:	12.375 %
Date Of Purchase:	December 6, 2004
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Two account statements from Cassa di Risparmio di Ferrara, both for the period of January 1, 2007 to June 30, 2007.

13

Table 12.

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	ARNOLDO DOLCETTI, NAVA TELLADE and GABRIELE DOLCETTI
Face Value:	U.S. \$166,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114GD65
Date Of Issuance:	February 21, 2001
Date Of Maturity:	February 21, 2012
Interest Rate/Payable:	12.375 %
Date Of Purchase:	December 1, 2004
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from Cassa di Risparmio di Ferrara, for the period of January 1, 2007 to June 30, 2007.

Table 13.

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	LUCA MULAZZANI
Face Value:	U.S. \$250,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114GD65
Date Of Issuance:	February 21, 2001
Date Of Maturity:	February 21, 2012
Interest Rate/Payable:	12.375 %
Date Of Purchase:	December 20, 2006
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from Antonveneta ABN AMRO, dated as of August 30, 2007.

15

Į

<u>Table 14.</u>

Plaintiff Bond Holder or Beneficial Owner:	LUCA MULAZZANI
Face Value:	U.S. \$50,000
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISIN No. US040114FC91
Date Of Issuance:	March 15, 2000
Date Of Maturity:	March 15, 2010
Interest Rate/Payable:	11.375 %
Date Of Purchase:	December 20, 2006
Acceleration:	March 27, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	Fiscal Agency Agreement, dated as of October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA")
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account statement from Antonveneta ABN AMRO, dated as of August 30, 2007.

DISCUSSION

This Court has already granted summary judgment in other cases to plaintiffs seeking to collect on the Republic's defaulted bonds issued under the 1994 FAA and the 1993 FAA. This has occurred in <u>Lightwater</u>, <u>supra</u>, <u>Mazzini v</u>. <u>Republic of Argentina</u>, No. 03 Civ. 8120, 2005 WL 743090 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 31, 2005), and other cases. Only certain specific issues need to be discussed in connection with the present motion.

Standing and Proof of Ownership

In the two opinions in Fontana v. Republic of Argentina, 415 F.3d 238 (2d Cir. 2005), and Applestein v. Province of Buenos Aires, 415 F.3d 242 (2d Cir. 2005), the Second Circuit has held that an owner of a beneficial interest, such as plaintiffs here, must receive authorization from the registered holder of the bond before it may sue, but that such authorization may be granted subsequent to the filing of a lawsuit. Alternatively, the Republic may waive the authorization requirement.

The Republic has agreed to waive objections based on lack of authorization where the court makes a finding of current ownership. <u>See</u> Transcript, March 28, 2006, <u>Cilli v. Republic of Argentina</u> (04 Civ. 6594).

Here, plaintiffs have adequately demonstrated through their account statements that they owned their beneficial interests as of June, August, September and October 2007. There is no evidence of any change of ownership thereafter.

17

Case 1:07-cv-02607-TPG Document 26 Filed 01/30/09 Page 18 of 18

CONCLUSION

The motion for summary judgment is granted. Judgment will be entered for the principal

amount of the bonds issued under the 1994 FAA and the 1993 FAA plus accrued interest.

The parties shall consult with one another concerning the form of the judgment and the

amounts of interest that should be awarded in the judgment. If the parties are able to reach

agreement, they shall jointly submit an agreed proposed judgment to the Court to be entered on a

date agreed to by the parties upon consultation with Chambers. If the parties are unable to reach

agreement on those subjects, plaintiff shall submit a proposed judgment to the Court, and the

Republic shall submit any objections to the proposed judgment within five business days

thereafter. The Court will then resolve any remaining disagreements. Proposed judgments

submitted to the Court should include the following language: "It is further ORDERED that,

until further notice from the Court, plaintiff(s) must refrain from selling or otherwise transferring

their beneficial interest in the bond(s) involved in this action without advising the Court in

advance and obtaining permission of the Court."

SO ORDERED.

Dated:

New York, New York

January 29, 2009

THOMAS P. GRIESA

U.S.D.J.

1